



## Comparative Study of Pakistani and Indonesian Secondary Schools' ELT Resources and its Effective Utilization

Muhammad Qasim Ali<sup>1</sup>, Azhar Mahmood<sup>2</sup>, Dewi Mutiara<sup>3</sup> and Qurrat-ul-Ain<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Education, The University of Lahore, Pakpattan Campus, Pakistan.

<sup>2</sup>Department of Education, International Islamic University, Islamabad, Pakistan

<sup>3</sup>The Faculty of Social & Political Sciences, Universitas Terbuka, Indonesia.

<sup>4</sup>Department of English, The University of Lahore, Pakpattan Campus, Pakistan

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Article history:

Received: 19 September 2016;

Received in revised form:

29 October 2016;

Accepted: 11 November 2016;

#### Keywords

English Teachers,  
ELT Resources,  
Utilization.

### ABSTRACT

In most of the developing countries including Pakistan and Indonesia, English is used as a foreign language. It continues to be one of the teaching subjects at school level, and the teaching of this language has a dominating influence over the whole structure of the educational system. There is a need to strengthen the background of students at basic Elementary as well Secondary level regarding teaching of English. The use of ELT (English Language Teaching) resources may enhance the second language learning in students. The objectives of the study are; 1) to find out the availability of resources in English teaching in Pakistan and Indonesia 2) to explore the utilization of available resources in teaching of English in Pakistan and Indonesia 3) to investigate the use of A.V. Aids in English language teaching in Pakistan and Indonesia 4) to make a comparison of the availability and utilization of available resources in teaching English in Pakistan and Indonesia. The present study was aimed at the comparison of the Secondary Schools ELT resources and its effective utilization in Pakistan and Indonesia. The study used the mixed method approach (quantitative and qualitative) to get the results. The researchers collected 200 teachers and 40 students as a sample of study from different provinces of Pakistan and Indonesia. The researchers developed questionnaire for teachers and structured interview for students. The researchers personally visited the target sample and administered it. For comparison, statistical techniques of mean and standard deviation were used. The findings of the study revealed that Indonesian English teachers are more equipped with latest tools than the Pakistani English teachers. Indonesian teachers have the facility of internet; on the other hands Pakistani teachers have not. The study concluded that due to the use of ELT resources, student feel more interest in the classroom as well as it saves teachers' time and energy.

© 2016 Elixir All rights reserved.

### Introduction

English language is the need of time as well as it's the language of science and technology. English is a foreign language in Pakistan. It continues to be one of the teaching subjects at school level, and the teaching of this language has a dominating influence over the whole structure of our educational system. Most of the teachers feel that there is a crisis in the education system of our country. Previous studies show a very striking manner that a high percentage of our students at school level have very poor achievement in English and also teachers shun of teaching English. Even after eight years of learning English, they are not able to speak even a right kind of sentence.

This has caused a great concern not only among English teachers, general teachers and their students, but also among parents, educators and administrators, in our teaching and learning practice. It is undoubtedly a major hindrance and very little progress in education will be possible unless something is done to get over this obstacle. Hence, it's a dire need, felt on

the part of researcher do a research on "the problems of teaching English as a foreign language at elementary level".

English occupies a vital and significant place in Pakistani society, as it is the language of science and technology in this present era. So, we can say that there could be no progress without the English language. It is the just source of communication all around the world, i.e. medium of research and international trade.

Beside international importance, the English language is the medium of instruction at school level in Pakistan. So there is a need of strengthening the background of students at basic and Elementary level and this can be done only when problems with their causes will be found and then remedial measures will be utilized for the purpose.

### Objectives of the Study

The objectives of the study will be;

1. To find out the availability of resources in English teaching in Pakistan and Indonesia.
2. To explore the utilization of avail resources in teaching of English in Pakistan and Indonesia.

3. To investigate the use of A.V. Aids in English language teaching in Pakistan and Indonesia.

4. To make a comparison of the availability and utilization of available resources in teaching English in Pakistan and Indonesia.

### Review of Literature

English language teaching materials and resources have divided into three categories: the old, the new and the newest. The first category includes the most traditional elements in a language classroom as the blackboard, the textbook, visual aids and hand-made (no cost, low cost) materials. The second category comprises the over-head projector, the audio player and the video camera and video players. The final category deals with the integration of ICT (information and communication technologies) in English language class.

Kausar (2013) quoting Joshi (1995) & Vissa (1994) indicate that the studies show that visual aids enhance the effectiveness of teaching learning process in a classroom. They reported that these aids were not only a source of help for the teacher but also provided stimulus variation that was indispensable to sustain learners' attention. The use of audio visual aids makes the task of learning a second language easy and enjoyable for the learner by targeting the maximum skills of the learner. Furthermore, Kausar (2013) indicate that according to Ranasinghe and Leisher (2009) point out that teaching student the use of technology as a learning tool enhances their learning. They facilitate learning by giving exposure to native speakers' correct pronunciation and interesting conversations between them.

Refer to Çakir (2006) it is a well-known fact that audio-visual materials are a great help in stimulating and facilitating the learning of a foreign language. Furthermore, Çakir (2006) quoting Wright (1976:1) that many media and many styles of visual presentation are useful to the language learner. That is to say, all audio-visual materials have positive contributions to language learning as long as they are used at the right time, in the right place. According to a research, language teachers like video because it motivates learners, brings the real world into the classroom, contextualizes language naturally and enables learners to experience authentic language in a controlled environment (Çakir, 2006, pp.68).

It is generally said that students like the language class when teachers use different audio-visual materials because it motivates them to pay more attention in the class and they can relate their learning with their real life (Çakir, 2006, pp.67).

Some of these opinions indicate how large the benefits of the use of audio visual in English language learning for both students and teachers. This is in line with what is delivered by Daniel (2013) that the main purposes of teaching through audio-visual aids are:

1. They help to avoid excessive, empty and meaningless verbalization in teaching English.
2. They provide direct sense experience to students.
3. They help students to form clear and accurate concepts in English.
4. They make teaching and learning effective.
5. They provide variety to teaching.
6. They provide interest and inspiration.
7. They create language atmosphere.
8. They reduce teachers talking.
9. They clarify the subject-matter.
10. They save time and energy.

In practice, for various reasons not all teachers want to take advantage of audio- visual aids when they teach English or

other foreign languages . This is supported by Capper (2003) in Nalliveettil George Mathew & Ali Odeh Hammoud Alidmat (2013) indicate that the points out that many teachers who have access to the technology will not use it because they do not have technical knowledge and are satisfied with their current approach to teaching. He says that these teachers either find many difficulties while using technology or they do not have sufficient time to gather relevant lessons supported by technology.

According to Banpho (2001) English language teaching resources in Thailand generally consist of print materials with little use of A. V. Aids, realia kits, cassettes, video and language laboratories. The inclusion of information communication technology, particularly the more sophisticated form of the internet, is still rare, in spite of strong support by education policies. Same the situation is prevailing in Pakistani secondary schools.

From all corners of country, most teachers would agree that the textbook is the most important and frequently used single resource at secondary level. In fact, a textbook does not only provide the teacher with a topic, some texts and a good number of activities; it also caters for some important details which are quite difficult to implement without the aid of a textbook: variety of texts and activities, rich visual design, procedures for continuous and final assessment, a clear statement of objectives and its relationship to texts and activities, etc. For that very same reason, it is extremely important to choose the most appropriate textbook and, then, to use it wisely. In order to achieve both objectives, some usage procedures and a checklist to choose a textbook will be shown below.

### Research Methodology

The present study was aimed at the comparison of the Secondary Schools ELT resources and its effective utilization in Pakistan and Indonesia. The study was a descriptive survey research. The researchers conducted the study to find out the ELT resources and its effective utilization at secondary schools. The researchers collected the opinions from secondary school teachers about the existing ELT resources and their effective utilization in the teaching learning process at secondary level.

Population of the study was comprised all the secondary school teachers (English) from Pakistan and Indonesia. The sample of the study was collected from the province of Punjab (Pakistan), Jakarta and Bogor (Indonesia). Convenient sample technique was used to collect data. Sample of the study comprised 200 subjects, 100 secondary school teachers who teach English to the secondary school students from each of the provinces from Pakistan and Indonesia.

The researchers developed the questionnaire as a research tool by reviewing the related literature, relevant documents and research questions. The questionnaire was well validated by the experts in the field. Cronbach's Alpha for the questionnaire was 0.83. The questionnaires were administered to collect the data. The researchers were personally visited the sample of the study. The sample was collected in the month of November and December 2015.

After the collection of data, it was tabulated, analyzed and interpreted in the light of objectives of the study by using mean score of the objects. Finally mean score is compared for the purpose of taking results.

**Table 1. Availability of resources in English teaching**

S. No.	Statement	Mean		SD	
		Pak	Ind	Pak	Ind
1	Teachers are fully provided with latest tools to use for teaching of English.	4.27	4.63	.815	.661
2	Class rooms are fully decorated with pictures to be used as assistance in language teaching.	4.46	4.54	.702	.758
3	Internet facility at secondary level is sufficient for the teachers in teaching English.	3.79	4.50	1.241	.759
4	Teachers use language material in the class.	3.35	4.54	1.527	.809
5	Teachers are provided with headphones to be used for students.	3.79	4.28	1.274	.986
6	Available ELT resources are sufficient for teachers to use in the class.	3.78	3.99	1.060	.735
7	There is white board/blackboard in the classroom for teaching English.	2.95	4.26	1.507	.676
8	There are charts in the classroom for teaching English.	2.99	4.15	1.243	.575
9	There are flash cards in the classroom for teaching English.	4.32	4.13	.680	.580

In table 1 the mean score of Pakistani secondary school teachers (4.27, 4.46, 3.79, 3.57, 3.35, 3.79, 3.78, 2.95, 2.99, and 4.32) and mean score of Indonesian secondary school teachers (4.64, 4.54, 4.50, 4.51, 5.54, 4.28, 3.99, 4.26, 4.15, and 4.13). The mean score goes from 2.95 to 4.63 that show Indonesian secondary school teachers are provided with latest tools in the use of teaching English than Pakistani secondary school teacher, it is supported by the results of the first statement in the table 1. The statement 8 refers that Indonesian secondary school teachers have the strong opinion about the whiteboard/blackboard in the classroom for teaching English but Pakistani teachers have dispersion in their opinion regarding the existence of whiteboard/blackboard in the classroom for teaching English. Indonesian teachers have the perception that there are charts in the classroom for teaching English but on contrary, Pakistani teachers have more dispersion of opinion regarding charts in the classroom for teaching English.

**Table 2. Utilization of available resources in English teaching**

S. No.	Statement	Mean		SD	
		Pak	Ind	Pak	Ind
10	Teacher uses the white board in the classroom.	4.16	4.54	.861	.688
11	Teacher makes the use of charts.	3.75	4.19	1.403	.734
12	Teachers use the recordings for teaching in the classroom.	4.53	3.67	.846	.792
13	Teachers use internet which provides them latest knowledge.	4.22	4.34	.938	.794
14	Using computers for language teaching enhances students' knowledge.	3.16	4.51	1.522	.659

Pakistani teachers make the use of language material within the classroom less than that of Indonesian teachers. Indonesian teachers have the clearer perceptions than Pakistani teachers about the statement of available ELT resources are sufficient for teachers to use in the class. Indonesian secondary teachers have the perception than

Pakistani secondary school teachers regarding the internet facility at secondary level for teachers in teaching English. But Pakistani teachers have great difference of opinion about internet facility. There is a small difference between the perception of Pakistani and Indonesian secondary school teachers about the statement of ELT resources that there are flash cards in the classroom for teaching English.

Table 2 illustrates the utilization of available resources in teaching of English. The means score of Pakistani secondary school teachers (4.16, 3.75, 4.53, 4.22, and 3.16) and mean score of Indonesian secondary school teachers (4.54, 4.19, 3.67, 4.34, and 4.51). The mean score goes from 3.16 to 4.54 illustrate that Indonesian secondary school teachers make the more use of white board in the classroom as compared to Pakistani secondary school teachers. Pakistani secondary school teachers have the dispersion of opinion regarding the utilization of charts in the teaching of English but Indonesian teachers are more committed to make the use of charts in the classrooms. Indonesian teachers are more lenient in the use of internet to provide latest knowledge to the students as compared to Pakistani teachers. Indonesian teachers have the perception that use of computer in language teaching enhances students' knowledge but Pakistani teachers have dispersion in their opinion about the statement that use of computer in language teaching enhances students' knowledge

**Table 3. Use of A. V. Aids in English language teaching**

S. No.	Statement	Mean		SD	
		Pak	Ind	Pak	Ind
15	For Teaching English the teachers use A.V Aids.	4.15	4.17	.869	.570
16	Teachers find it interesting while using A.V aids in the class.	4.44	4.14	.833	.513
17	A.V. Aids are producing better results for language learning.	4.28	4.10	.877	.522
18	Projectors save time and energy of the ELT teachers.	2.53	4.43	1.389	.685
19	Language tools reduce burden of the ELT teacher.	3.96	4.53	1.014	.688

Table 3 illustrates the use of A. V. Aids in English language teaching in secondary schools. The means score of Pakistani secondary school teachers (4.15, 4.44, 4.28, 2.53, and 3.96) and mean score of Indonesian secondary school teachers (4.17, 4.14, 4.10, 4.43, and 4.53). The mean score goes from 2.53 to 4.53 illustrate that Indonesian secondary school teachers are more clear about their perception of language tools reduce burden of the ELT teacher as compared to the Pakistani secondary school teachers. Pakistani teachers vary in their view toward language tools reduce burden of the ELT teachers. Pakistani secondary school teachers think that use of A. V. Aids make the environment of class interesting. On contrary, Indonesian teachers are less motivated toward the statement that teachers find it interesting while using A. V. Aids in the class as compared to Pakistani teachers. Pakistani teachers have the more perception about the statement, "A. V. Aids are producing better results for language learning" than Indonesian teachers. Majority of the Indonesian teachers have the perception that projectors save time and energy of ELT teachers as compared to Pakistani teachers.

### Findings and Conclusions

The study reveals that the Indonesian teachers who teach English in secondary schools are more equipped with latest tools than the Pakistani secondary teachers who teach English. The Indonesian teachers are very much clear about the availability of ELT resources within the class. There are

findings of the study that Indonesian teachers have the facility of internet at their schools but majority of the Pakistani secondary school teachers are confused about the availability of internet within the school environment. Indonesian teachers have the perception that they have the availability of blackboards/whiteboards in the schools but in most of the Pakistani secondary school classrooms have no blackboard/whiteboard at all for teaching. The observation and statistical results reveal that Indonesian teachers make the frequent use of whiteboard as compared to Pakistani secondary school teachers. It is also found in the study that Indonesian teachers have clear perception about the use of computer in language teaching enhances the student knowledge. The observations and results show, Indonesian teachers think that language tools/A.V. aids reduces the burden of ELT teachers. As far as Pakistani secondary teachers have the view that the use of A.V. aids make the classroom environment interesting. It is found that Pakistani teachers have the perception that through the use of A.V. aids we can get better results in language learning. Indonesian teacher are more conscious toward saving time and energy through the use of ELT resources.

It is concluded that Indonesian secondary school teachers who are teaching English as a foreign language, have the more availability of ELT resources in their classrooms as compared to Pakistani secondary school' classrooms. Indonesian secondary teachers make the fullest use of available ELT resources in their classrooms. On contrary, Pakistani secondary teachers who teach English to the secondary school students have the shortage of ELT resources as well as they are not ready to make the fullest use of the available sources for the teaching of English. It is also concluded that ELT resources is the cause that make students feel more interest in

the classroom as well as save the time and energy of the teacher.

#### References

- Amina, F (2006). Teaching speaking skills through phonics at primary level. Retrieve from *theses.aiou.edu.pk*
- Banpho, P. (2001). University ELT faculty's use of IT, Their opinions on the roles of IT and the promising tasks. *PASAA*, 31, 64-72
- Çakir, D. I. (2006). The Use of Video as an Audio-Visual Material in Foreign Language Teaching Classroom. *The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 5(4), 67-72.
- Daniel, J. (2013). Audio-Visual Aids in Teaching of English. *International Journal of Innovative Research in Science, Engineering and Technology*, 2(8).
- Kausar, G. (2013). Students' Perspective of the Use of Audio visual Aids in Pakistan. *IPEDR*, 68(3).
- Mathew, N.G & Alidmat, A.O.H. (2013). A Study on the Usefulness of Audio-Visual Aids in EFL Classroom:Implications for Effective Instruction. *International Journal of Higher Education Vol*, 2(2).
- Mughal, N. H. (2000).A study to examine the competencies of teachers teaching English at secondary school certificate level in Islamabad. Unpublished MA Thesis Teacher Education Department.
- Poblete, J. H. (1999). Communicating Christian values through teaching English as a second language: The use of poetry. 24<sup>th</sup> International Faith and Learning Seminar.
- Thakur, J. (2013).Challenges and Prospects in Teaching of English at Elementary School Level. *Educationia Confab* 2(1). pp. 125-133