Performance contracting as a paradigm shift in the utilization of teaching & learning resources perceptions of tutors from selected technical institutes in Kenya

Biutha Manwa Mosomi¹, Jonah Kindiki¹, Arthur K. Nzau² and Betty M. Mwelu¹
¹Department of Educational Management and Policy Studies, Moi University.
²Department of Educational Foundations, Moi University.

ABSTRACT
Every year thousands of students leave the regular formal educational institutions in Kenya, but they cannot progress to higher levels of formal education. Despite past investments in Kenya’s Technical, Industrial, Vocational Education and Training (TIVET) subsector, many school leavers fail to access TIVET. This is because the subsector is said to be facing many challenges related to wastage of resources, irrelevant training and turnover of personnel. Performance contracting has been acclaimed as an effective and promising means of improving the performance of public enterprises as well as government departments. The government of Kenya introduced performance contract signing in the year 2004. The performance contracts were aimed at improving resource utilization in public institutions among other objectives. This study sought to establish the perceptions of Kenyan tutors in Technical Institutes in Rift Valley about the impact of performance contracts as a paradigm shift on the utilization of teaching and learning resources. The study adopted a survey strategy. The study population comprised of tutors, Heads of Department and Principals of randomly selected public Technical Institutes in Kenya. The stratified random sampling technique was applied in the selection of the study sample. This involved the grouping of tutors into 8 strata according to the available departments. Thereafter the proportionate random sampling technique was applied to get an equal proportion of respondents from each stratum. The saturated sampling technique was used to sample the heads of department and principals. Questionnaires and interviews were used to collect data. This entailed the supplying of questionnaires to tutors, heads of department and principals of the sampled Technical Institutes. Interviews were conducted with principals of the sampled institutions.

Introduction
The use of performance contracts has been acclaimed as an effective and promising means of improving the performance of public enterprises as well as government departments (Letangule and Letting, 2012). Governments are increasingly faced with the challenge to do things but with fewer resources (Kobia and Mohamed, 2006; Letangule and Letting, 2012). Performance contracts have been defined as a range of management instruments used to define responsibilities and expectations between parties to achieve mutually agreed results. Additionally, performance contracts have been described as agreements between a government and a public agency which establishes general goals for the agency, sets targets for measuring performance and provides incentives for achieving those targets (Hunter & Gates, 1998; Letangule & Letting, 2012).

Performance contracts have been successfully applied in public institutions in various countries such as South Korea, Malaysia, India, France and Pakistan before being introduced in Kenya (AAPAM, 2005; Kobia and Mohammed, 2006). The objectives of introducing performance contracts in Kenya were to improve service delivery to the public by ensuring that resources are focused on the attainment of key national policy priorities among other objectives (Kobia and Mohamed, 2006). Vocational and technical education and training were among the public institutions that were targeted in this programme. This is because vocational and technical education and training are crucial for a country’s sustainable human capital and economic development. In Africa there is fresh awareness among policy makers and the international donor community that technical innovation and vocational education and training (TIVET) can play a critical role in national development (African Union, 2007; in Hooker et al, 2011).


According to Hooker, Mwiyearia, Ocharo and Clark (2011) the TIVET subsector is critical to the development of industry and required human capacities. High quality training services must therefore be delivered by the subsector to enhance productivity and required competencies. Good and competitive TIVET systems in developing and emerging economies provide highly
skilled labor to attract direct foreign investment. Every year thousands of students leave the regular formal educational institutions in Kenya, but they cannot progress to higher levels of formal education (Onsomu et al., 2009). The TIVET subsector offers programmes that target those students who do not progress to higher levels of formal education. In this way, they too can acquire skills and competencies for engagement in wage employment or self-employment.

Hooker et al. (2011) however note that for many years the planning, financing and delivery of TIVET programmes in Kenya has been a source of concern. Onsomu et al. (2009) also observe that despite past investments in Kenya’s TIVET subsector many school leavers fail to access TIVET or if they do, acquire low quality training and the skills acquired fail to facilitate them from becoming self-reliant and productive in the absence of wage employment.

According to Kimenyi, Mwabu and Manda (2006) the TIVET subsector in Kenya currently faces a number of challenges. These include fragmentation of programmes, limited integration into the formal education system, insufficient finances and limited alignment with technological innovation. The GOK (2005a) report also notes that the TIVET subsector faces challenges brought about by globalization and associated technological change. In addition poor coordination of TIVET leads to wastage of resources, irrelevant training and turnover of personnel.

Onsomu et al. (2009) contend that given these challenges, improvements in planning, financing, proper utilization of resources and delivery of TIVET programmes in Kenya are necessary. These improvements can be accomplished in ways that increase capacity, enhance quality and relevance, upgrade learning and teaching facilities and modernize the training and learning environment in TIVET institutions. The government in a bid to improve the utilization of resources in the public sector introduced the performance contracting strategy in 2004 (Obong’o, 2009). In Kenya, performance contracting is defined as a freely negotiated performance agreement between the government and respective ministry, department or agency which clearly specifies the intentions, obligations and responsibilities of the two contracting parties. As such, it stipulates the results to be achieved by the contracted party (Panel of Experts, 2010).

Onsomu et al. (2009) opine that Kenya’s TIVET system needs to be performed in order to bring about professionalism amongst TIVET staff and engineer sound resource utilization mechanisms. According to Balogun (2003) new public management practices have invariably been seen through the public reform initiatives in many developing countries as the solution to reversing falling service delivery and poor resource utilization. Kobia and Mohammed (2006) observe that annual renewable performance contracts were first re-introduced in Kenya in the year 2004 in 16 state corporations after the earlier process that was introduced in 1989 had failed. The earlier process had failed due to lack of provision for the impact of external factors like changes in the government of Kenya policies, inflation and exchange rate fluctuations which would have made evaluation fair. They contend that with the re-introduction of performance contracts, the expected outcomes include improved performance, increased transparency and better resource utilization.

Stringer (2006) argues that in order to avoid the risk of reporting spurious findings, studies on performance management should consider the interconnections of all related variables. These include outcomes of performance contracting like resource utilization and service delivery. Katelaar (2004) notes that for performance contracting to succeed there must be efficiency in resource utilization. According to Abdulkaram, Fassas and Akinubi (2011) all educational resources are vital to the achievement of national objectives. Afolabi (2005) cited in Abdulkaram et al (2011) observes that no matter how beautiful the programmes and assets of an institution are, without the academic staff, attainment of institutional goals and objectives would prove abortive. This is because human resources are the people who constitute the workforce in an organization. Their availability and utilization therefore would determine the success or failure of the education system.

The government in recognition of this, in Vision 2030 (Government of Kenya, 2008) proposes that to meet the skill needs of a rapidly industrializing economy, new technical training institutions should be established. The blue print suggests that the government commits more resources to scientific research, technical capacities of the workforce and in partnership with the private sector increase funding to TIVET institutions. Given the potential of economic benefits from investment in training, it is not surprising that TIVET is being given increased attention in Africa (Onsomu et al., 2009). The government of Kenya is committed to reforming the TIVET sector so as to ensure the programmes offered are relevant and there is adequate supply of critical skills and competencies for local and global labor markets as identified in the Kenya Vision 2030 (GOK, 2008). Onsomu et al. (2009) however note that those reforms have note borne fruit. They call for radical changes to be instituted to ensure that there is a complete reform of the TIVET sector.

The performance contracting strategy according to Kobia and Mohammed (2006) was aimed at radically changing the management practices in public institutions. The radical change in management practices was hoped to lead to improvement in performance, increased transparency and resource utilization. Such a strategy would therefore augment greatly the government’s efforts in reforming the TIVET sector.

In order to find out whether the reform efforts of the TIVET sector have so far worked, it was important to gauge employees’ attitudes. This is because as Othman and Melissa (2007) observe, not much information is readily available with regards to the perceptions of employees, academicians and non-academicians on the implementation of new management practices in education institutions. Understanding employees’ attitudes towards implementation of new management practices would be able to facilitate smooth adoption of the same since human resources are the most valuable assets held by any higher learning institution. Priority therefore according to Othman and Melissa (2007) should be given to the gauging of their perceptions towards the changes in management adopted by the institutions.

There have been mixed reports about the success of performance contracting in improving service delivery and resource utilization in Kenya. While some reports indicate that the process has been successful, others indicate the opposite. Barasa (2008) for example observes that the introduction of performance contracts has evidently led to greater accountability in management of public resources and service delivery. The Government of Kenya (GOK, 2010) on the other hand reported from findings of a study that the public was not fully satisfied with the performance results announced yearly since they did not relate to service delivery. A study by Donell and Turner (2005) on the other hand found out that the adoption of
performance agreements had been slow and enjoyed limited success.

Statement of the Problem

The introduction of performance contracting in Kenya was aimed at among other things to bring about a radical transformation in resource utilization in public institutions. That was in turn intended to lead to improvement in public servants’ performance. Various reports about performance contracting in the public sector however indicated that such a paradigm shift had not been realized (GOK, 2010; Barasa, 2008; POE, 2010). The reports that had come out were about how the public institutions had achieved their targets and their rankings thereafter. It had however not been established whether the reports were just paperwork or there was actual impact on the ground that met the original goals of performance contracting, that is, improved resource utilization, improved performance and self-reliance.

In the past the government had invested a lot in the TIVET sub-sector. The efforts have however not borne fruit due to resource wastages and management inefficiencies. Given the importance of the TIVET sub-sector as shown in the background of the study and the call for reforms in its management, it was prudent to find out whether the performance contracting strategy had served to reinvigorate it as required. This study therefore endeavored to determine how tutors in technical institutes in Kenya perceived performance contracts’ impact on teaching and learning resources’ utilization.

It is against this background that the study attempted to provide answers to the objective of:
- finding out tutors’ perceptions about performance contracts’ impact on teaching/learning materials’ utilization.

Research Design And Methodology

This study adopted both qualitative and quantitative approaches. The adoption of both approaches enabled the researcher to exploit the strengths of both while minimizing weaknesses from either. The use of more than one approach enhances confidence in the ensuing findings as it reduces the limitations associated with either research approach (Patton, 2002; Manion & Cohen, 2011).

The descriptive survey strategy was adopted for this study. This approach enabled the researcher to establish the feelings, opinions and perceptions of tutors in technical training Institutes about performance contracting and its impact on teaching/learning resources’ utilization. It also helped in getting their opinions about other components like performance assessment, performance targets and performance rewards. That enabled the researcher to find out the impact performance contracts had on resource utilization. That was in agreement with Borg (1981) and Gay (1992) who observe that the descriptive approach of the case study strategy is suitable in collecting data about occurrences or incidence/instances of events in varying situations and circumstances in order to determine the opinions, attitudes, preferences and perceptions of persons of interest to the researcher.

Target Population

The target population was the 17 public technical training institutes in Kenya. It also included members of the teaching staff of the technical training Institutes in Kenya. Principals of the same institutes, their deputies and heads of department were also part of the target population.

Sample Size

The following formula as given by Neuman (2011) was used to determine the sample size:

\[ S = \frac{N(CV)^2}{CV^2 + (N-1)} \]

Where \( S \) = the desired sample size when the population is less than 10,000.

\( N \) = the population

\( CV \) = Tolerance at desired level of confidence (0.05 at 95% confidence Level).

Sampling Techniques

The study adopted the simple random sampling technique to select five technical training institutes in Kenya. It then adopted the stratified random sampling technique to group the tutors into strata according to the available departments. Thereafter the proportionate random sampling technique was used to get an equal proportion of respondents from each stratum. After deciding on the sample for each department the simple random sampling technique was applied to pick the respondents. The saturated sampling technique was used in getting a sample from the principals and heads of department. That meant that all heads of department and all principals in the sampled technical training institutes made the study sample. The adoption of various sampling techniques was suitable since it catered for the collection of data from different segments of the target population (Kerlinger, 1973; Kothari, 2004).

Instrumentation

Questionnaires were used to collect data from tutors and Heads of Department, while interviews were used to collect data from the principals.

a) Questionnaires

They were used in getting information from tutors and heads of departments in public technical training Institutes on their perceptions about performance contracts’ impact on teaching/learning resources’ utilization. It was structured in a way that it contained both open and closed ended response items. The instrument was preferred for data collection because according to Kothari (2004) questionnaires reduce bias associated with interviews as answers are in the respondents’ own words. They also enable respondents who are not easily approachable to be reached conveniently.

b) Interviews

Interviews were used to seek for information from the principals of the institutes. They sought to find out the views of the principals about performance contracts’ impact on the utilization of teaching/learning resources. That enabled the researcher to probe for in-depth data since they did not restrict the respondents. They also enabled the researcher to seek for immediate clarification from the respondents. This was in agreement with Kothari’s (2004) observation that more information and of greater depth can be obtained while the interviewer by his own skill can overcome the resistance if any of the respondents and the interview method can be made to yield an almost perfect sample of the general population.

Pilot Study

The formulated instruments were subjected to a pilot study in order to enable the researcher to measure their reliability and validity. The pilot study was carried out in two of the public technical Institutes in Kenya. The Institutes were selected because they are among the biggest in terms of student population and staffing. In addition, they have many teaching and learning resources hence the researcher felt that the piloting of instruments there would have produced accurate results. They were however excluded from the final study.

Reliability of the Instruments

The instruments were tested for reliability by administering them in a pilot study. The coefficient of internal consistency of
the split half reliability method was applied. The questionnaires that were administered to the pilot group had their scores ranked. The scores were divided into two equal sets and each subject’s score computed. After dividing the questionnaires into two comparable halves, the Spearman Brown proficiency formula was then applied in testing the results. That resulted into a split half estimate of 0.814. That indicated that the instrument was reliable to be applied in the collection of data for the study (Kirk, 2008; Johnson, 2010).

**Validity of the Instruments**

The research instruments, that is, the tutors’ and heads of department questionnaires and interview schedules were validated through the application of content validity procedures. The researcher established content validity by seeking expert judgment from his supervisors while developing and revising the research instruments. The results from the piloting were also used in determining the validity of the instruments.

**Findings**

**Performance Contracting and Utilization of Teaching/ Learning Resources**

The purpose of the study was to establish the perceptions of tutors in technical institutes about performance contracts as a paradigm shift in teaching and learning resources’ utilization. Findings of the data collected during the study are presented here based on the objective of the study. Information on this issue was sought from tutors and heads of department through questionnaires and from principals through interviews.

**Perceptions about the Impact of PCs on Utilization of Teaching/Learning Materials**

The respondents (HoDs and tutors) were asked to rate the impact of PCs on the utilization of teaching/learning materials. HoDs’ Responses on Perceptions on PCs’ Impact on Utilization of T/L Materials

Results in Table 1 indicate that a slight majority of the HoDs agreed (42%) that PCs had an impact on utilization of T/L materials. However, a relatively large proportion of HoDs, being 30%, disagreed. Overall 48% of the HoDs perceived the PCs to have had an impact on the utilization of T/L materials. Figure 4.3 shows disparities in the variables regarding utilization of T/L materials.

![Figure 1.1: HoDs rating of staff perception of utilization of T/L Materials due to PCs](image)

Referring to Figure 1.1 the PCs had the greatest impact on better use of library facilities (67%) and better inventory control of the T/L materials (54%). Otherwise, PCs had little impact on adequacy of T/L materials, use of latest materials as well as use of ICT and improving procurement of T/L materials as shown by 53% of the HoDs who disagreed.

**Tutors’ Views on Perceptions on PCs’ Impact on Utilization of T/L Materials**

The tutors were also asked to indicate their perception of the impact of PCs on utilization of T/L materials. Table 2 shows the findings.

Referring to Table 2, most of the tutors, being 65% overall (9% for strongly agree and 56% for agree), generally were in agreement that PCs had an impact on the utilization of T/L materials compared to the 25% who were in disagreement, (19% for disagree and 6% for strongly disagree). The indicators of T/L material utilization as a result of PCs showed differences in the way the tutors perceived the impact. Figure 1.2, shows the differences.

![Figure 1.2: Tutors’ views on PCs’ impact on utilization of T/L Materials](image)

Figure 1.2 shows that PCs had the greatest impact on improving procurement of T/L materials (69%), followed by use of library facilities (56%) and optimum use of materials (43%). The findings show that the PCs had an impact of varying magnitudes on the use of T/L materials. The result from tutors’ responses for example indicated that performance contracting had increased access of computers and e-learning to tutors and other members of staff. The impact was not however felt greatly due to inadequacy of the said resources.

**Findings from Qualitative Data**

The principals’ responses indicated that performance contracting had greatly changed the face of technical institutes. This was witnessed by the fact that there was enhanced utilization of available resources and inclusion of areas that were hitherto not in the scope of the institutes’ educational coverage. This was indicated by all the 3 principals who said that areas like environmental conservation were before the advent of performance contracting not taken seriously yet now they were being addressed appropriately.

This was as a result of increase in the utilization of existing space to plant more trees and clean up unwanted materials in the institutes. Extra time was being utilized to teach both staff and students on proper sexual behavior in order to reduce the prevalence of HIV infections. The principals however pointed out that proper utilization of learning and teaching resources was hindered by a scarcity of financial resources. The lack of finances made some resources not to be availed hence hindering the impact of performance contracting on the ground. The principals are quoted noting that:

> Proper utilization of learning and teaching resources is hindered by a scarcity of financial resources. The lack of finances makes some resources not to be availed hence hindering the impact of performance contracting on the ground.

Findings from tutors, heads of department and principals indicated that aspects of performance contracting that included service charters; mission and vision statements and quality policies had led to improved utilization of learning and teaching resources. According to the tutors, performance contracting had led to some improvement in the utilization of learning and teaching resources. They however pointed out that more needed...
to be done to make the strategy have more impact on resource utilization. They pointed out that some of the areas that needed to be addressed included, training of supervisors on better approaches to implementing the strategy and availing of adequate human resources. Some of the hindrances to the effective utilization of resources they indicated included staff apprehension about performance contracting. This affected the way they used the performing contracting strategy in utilizing available resources. Some tutors however pointed out that there was no much change on the ground as far as learning and teaching resources were being utilized. They indicated that the strategy was hampered by too much paper work and lack of enough training in resource utilization for its impact to be strongly felt on the ground. The tutors also felt that the failure to meet the set targets shouldn’t be the only yardstick for measuring proper utilization of resources and hence the success of performance contracting. The responses by heads of department indicated that performance contracting as a strategy had generally led to improvement in the utilization of resources. Some of the areas that had improved due to performance contracting included access to e-learning resources and computer usage. The heads of department however indicated that the utilization of resources was hindered by the fact that the tutors were not properly prepared to implement the performance contracting strategy. That had in turn made them not to appreciate the strategy positively. The lack of adequate financial resources also hindered the proper utilization of resources to be achieved. Internet connectivity for example required a lot of financial resources to be properly utilized. Most technical institutes according to the heads of department were not endowed with adequate financial resources.

**Hypothesis Testing**

The study measured the perceptions of the teaching staff in the institute about the impact of PCs on the utilization of Teaching/learning resources (T/L). Chi-Square ($\chi^2$) tests were conducted to determine if there were significant associations between the perceived impact of PCs and the utilization of teaching/learning (T/L) resources. The hypothesis that was tested stated as follows:

$H_{02}$: There is no significant relationship between performance contracting and optimum utilization of T/L resources.

$H_{05}$: There is no significant relationship between performance contracting and optimum utilization of T/L resources. According to the chi-square test scores in Table 3, $P<.05$. The implication of this is that the null hypothesis is rejected. The alternate hypothesis that there is a significant relationship between performance contracting and utilization of resources is therefore adopted. This implies that there is a significant relationship between performance contracting and optimum utilization of T/L resources. The HoDs perceived the PCs to have a significant impact on improving the utilization of available Teaching/learning resources.

The perceptions of the tutors about the impact of PCs on the utilization of teaching/learning resources were also measured. Chi-Square ($\chi^2$) tests were therefore conducted to determine if there were significant associations between the perceived impact of PCs and the utilization of teaching/learning (T/L) resources. Before the Chi-square test, the variables were tested for reliability using the Cronbach Alpha test. The results revealed a coefficient of .730 which was considered strong enough for the Chi-square to be applied. The formulated hypothesis that was tested on this was stated as follows:

$H_{02}$: There is no significant relationship between performance contracting and optimum utilization of T/L resources.
Findings from tutors, heads of department and principals indicated that aspects of performance contracting that included service charters; mission and vision statements and quality policies had led to improved utilization of learning and teaching resources. The findings also indicated that financial constraints made teaching/learning resources not to be put into proper utilization. That came about in the sense that required resources could not be availed hence hindering performance. According to the findings of a study by Parnell and Carraher (2001) there is a positive relationship between performance and effective resource utilization. The study recommended appropriate strategy be aligned with specific resource competencies if the strategy is to be successful. In this regard, there is need to avail adequate teaching/learning resources if the impact of the performance contracting strategy is to achieve the expected impact. The findings of the study by Nyerere (2009) on the TIVET sector in Kenya had also revealed that recurrent budget reductions had negatively affected the number of qualifications due to inadequacy of teaching/learning resources. Another study by Onsomu et al (2009) also noted that the TIVET sub-sector faces challenges brought about by globalization and associated technological change. In addition poor coordination of TIVET leads to wastage of resources, irrelevant training and turnover of personnel.

Table 1. HoDs rating of staff Perceptions of Utilization of T/L Materials due to PCs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators of PCs Impact</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faster procurement of materials</td>
<td>3(12)</td>
<td>6(25)</td>
<td>5(21)</td>
<td>8(53)</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved use of library</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>16(67)</td>
<td>2(8)</td>
<td>5(21)</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved teaching</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>10(42)</td>
<td>2(8)</td>
<td>8(53)</td>
<td>3(13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using ICT</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>3(13)</td>
<td>8(33)</td>
<td>2(8)</td>
<td>8(53)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better use of latest</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>13(54)</td>
<td>5(21)</td>
<td>5(21)</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate supply of materials</td>
<td>2(8)</td>
<td>8(33)</td>
<td>2(8)</td>
<td>8(53)</td>
<td>2(8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better inventory of materials</td>
<td>3(13)</td>
<td>8(33)</td>
<td>2(8)</td>
<td>8(53)</td>
<td>2(8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative total (N=144)</td>
<td>8(33)</td>
<td>61(42)</td>
<td>18(13)</td>
<td>42(18)</td>
<td>7(5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Tutors’ self-perception of utilization of T/L materials due to PCs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators of PCs Impact</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Optimum use of materials</td>
<td>5(6)</td>
<td>35(43)</td>
<td>11(13)</td>
<td>26(32)</td>
<td>6(7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved use of library</td>
<td>8(9)</td>
<td>45(56)</td>
<td>6(7)</td>
<td>17(20)</td>
<td>6(7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved procurement</td>
<td>8(9)</td>
<td>56(69)</td>
<td>3(4)</td>
<td>12(15)</td>
<td>2(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative total (N=243)</td>
<td>21(9)</td>
<td>136(56)</td>
<td>20(8)</td>
<td>45(19)</td>
<td>14(6)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3. Results of $\chi^2$ test scores of PCs and optimum utilization of T/L resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource Type</th>
<th>Indicators of PCs Impact</th>
<th>Chi Square</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Utilization of T/L Materials</td>
<td>Optimum use of T/L resources</td>
<td>28.593</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. Results of $\chi^2$ test scores of tutors perceptions on performance contracting and optimum utilization of t/l resources.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource type</th>
<th>Indicators of pcs impact</th>
<th>Chi square</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Utilization of t/l materials</td>
<td>Better utilization of t/l resources</td>
<td>3.333</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.004</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
References


