Mawlana and the west: with special reference to translation

Amin Karimnia¹, Mahboobeh Ebrahimzade² and Zahra Jafari²

¹Department of English Language, Fasa Branch, Islamic Azad University, Iran.
²Department of Translation Studies, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Fars, Iran.

ARTICLE INFO
Article history:
Received: 25 March 2012;
Received in revised form: 15 May 2012;
Accepted: 28 May 2012;

Keywords
Mawlana, Red house, Winfield, Wilson, Nicholson, Bark and Helminski.

ABSTRACT
The present paper attempts to investigate the influence of Mawlana, the 13th century Persian poet, through translations done of his work in the West. Translation of Mawlana’s works started in Germany in 1809. In 1881 Redhouse started translation of Mawlana in English, later other translators like Winfield in 1887, Wilson in 1910, and Nicholson in 1935, created their translations. Bark in 1995 created his version of the Masnavi according to Nicholson’s translation. Then, Helmsinki in 1994 and 1996 created his version. Helmsinki’s version like Bark’s was according to Nicholson’s translation. These translations caused Mawlana’s thoughts and works penetrate among the whole people of the world. Among them Americans have bigger portions.

Introduction
Mawlana Jalal ud-Din Muhammad also known as Jalal ad-Din Muhammad Rumi was a 13th century Persian Muslim poet. He was born in Balkh in Khorasan, nowadays known as Tajikistan (Foroozanfar, 1987). His father Bahaud-Din Walad was a Sufi. He left Balkh because of Mongols invasion and settled in Konia, Turkey in present day. At the death of his father he succeeded his religious position (Chittick, 2005). It is mentioned that Rumi inherited his father when he aged 25 and became the head of a religious school. Rumi’s public life began after his master’s death; he became an Islamic jurist, issuing fatwa and giving sermons in the mosques of Konia (Foroozanfar, 1987). Rumi’s greatest changes of life occurred through his familiarization with his friends who became his masters, the most influential of them was Shams-e Tabrizi. His meeting with Shams was a revolution in his life. As Foroozanfar (1987) stated, Rumi who was an accomplished teacher and jurist became a hermit and turned to poetry. Rumi produced his prose and poetic works after his inner revolution.

Divan-I Kabir or Divan-I Shams –e Tabrizi was the first collection of his poems. He named it in honor of his master Shams –e Tabrizi. Chittick (2005, p.5) stated that “Rumi’s second best known work in the Divan- I Shams- I Tabrizi, totaling some 40000 couplets, which is a collection of poems describing the mystical states and expounding various points of Sufi order.”

Masnavi, Rumi’s major work that contains 26000 verses, is in six volumes and some Sufi regard it as the Persian – language Koran. The six volume of the Masnavi is divided in three categories subjectively: Book I and Book ii concerned with the Nafs, the lower carnal self, and it’s self – deception and evil tendencies. In Book iii and iv the main themes is Reason and Knowledge. Book v and vi concerned with the universal ideal that man should deny his earthy existence to understand God’s existence (Foroozanfar, 1987).

The third work by Rumi, Fihī ma Fihī [“In it is What is in it”], which collected by Rumi’s disciples contained Rumi’s sermons and conversations (Chittick, 2005).

Majales –e Saba [seven sermons], is seven Persian sermons or lectures in seven different assemblies. The sermons also include quotations from poems of Sanai, Attar and other poets including Mawlana himself (Daru I, Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008).

Makatib (the letters), is the book contains Mawlana’s letters in Persian to his disciples, his family members and the men of his society. After leaving out such valuable works, Mawlana died when he aged 68. He was buried in Konia and his lovers visit his shrine (Foroozanfar, 1987).

The purpose of the present paper is an investigation of the influence of Mawlana in the west, through translations done of his works. First, researchers investigate the available translations of the Masnavi by English translators like: Redhouse (1881), Whinfield (1887), Wilson (1910), Nicolson (1926), Arberry (1944), and Turkmen (1992). Then, compare them with the original text of the Masnavi. The influences of these translations in the west are discussed.

Translators
Rumi’s poems and thoughts penetrated all over the world in recent centuries. Different scholars in various countries have tried to translate Rumi’s poems and made it accessible for students in universities and the public. Rasekh(2009) explained that translating from Rumi started with Sir William Jones who is famous for his translation of Hafez. In 1791 in a lecture in Asiatic Association Jones translated the beginning couplets of the Masnavi. His translation in English may be the first translation of Masnavi into a European language. Later a French diplomat, Jack Fan Walenburg, started translating Masnavi to French but his translation burnt in a firing before publication.

Joseph Von Hammer Purgstall
For the first time Rumi attracted German orientalist’s attention and they started translating his works to German. An Austrian diplomat Joseph Von Hammer Purgstall (1774-1856) in...
a journal of oriental studies in 1809 published some translations from Rumi (Jalal, 2010).

Another German poet Friedrich Ruckert, the disciple of Purgstall, infatuated in Mawlana through his master’s translation and in 1819 sang beautiful poems under the influence of Ghaselen that was mostly similar to Divan – I Shams (Rashekh, 2009).

It is stated that Ghaselen was a collection of exquisite poems that reflected the true spirit of Mawlana’s works, and played a crucial role in introducing Rumi to the poets and philosophers like Platon and Hegel. Ghaselen, which contained 44 ghazals of Mawlana, was a free adaptation for which Ruckert used Purgstall’s translations as a source. In Ghaselen Ruckert talked about what Mawlana talked in his works as love, longing, and unity. Ruckert’s translations of Rumi works attracted many others attention. The poet August Graf (1796-1835), inspired by Ruckert’s Ghaselen, published a collection of his ghazals and named it Ghaselen. His ghazals which were over 150 were published in four separate collections.

Another person inspired by Ruckert’s translation was a Scottish clergyman and Hegelian philosopher William Hastie (1824-1903). Hastie who was worried about the expansion of the “unreligious attitude” of Khayyam/Khayyam was growing fast in English circle in the late 19th century, translated it in English in ghazal form to show superiority of Rumi over Khayyam. The influence of Ruckert’s translation was so vast; it also influenced the thoughts of famous thinkers George William Friedrich Hegel (1770-1831) and Karl Marx (1818-1883). Hegel familiarized with Rumi through Ruckert’s translation. It is said that Rumi influenced the development of Hegel’s dialectics. He addressed Rumi as “the excellent Jalal-ud din Rumi”. He also mentioned 21 poems of Rumi in his work “Encyclopedie der Philosophischen wissenschaften im Grundrisse”(1827). After Hegel, Marx, under the influence of Ruckert’s translations of Rumi gave a theory related to capital in the capitalist social system (Jalal, 2010).

Redhouse

Translation of Masnavi in English started with Redhouse translation of Book I in 1881(Dar ul Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008). Sir James William Redhouse who is known for his Turkish – English dictionary, translated Masnavi at the end of his life. Although he made a rhymed translation, it was not smooth and readable (Javadi, 2005). Later Nicholson, the greatest scholar in Rumi, criticized Redhouse’s translation as inaccurate. An example of Redhouse translation is compared with Nicholson’s accurate translation:

“What boot from counsel to a fool?

Dost thou know why the mirror (of thy soul) reflects nothing?

Because the rust is not cleaned from its face”(Masnavi I: 18, 34).

The story of the king, fall in love with a handmaiden and buying her.

O my friend, hearken to this tale: in truth it is the very marrow of our inward state” (Masnavi I, 35).

Distortion occurred in Redhouse’s translation, he mistakenly translated line 35 as part of the song of reed while it is the beginning line of the story of the king falling in love with a handmaiden and buying her (Dar ul Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008)

Whinfield

In 1887 Edward Henry Whinfield, who had translated Omar Khayyam and Gulshan – I Raz of Mahmud Shabusti published a translation of Masnavi as “ Masnavi – I Manavi, the spiritual couplets of Mawlana Jalalu ‘d – Din Muhammad I Rumi “, a selection of all six book contained 3500 couplets both in prose and poetry. It was the best translation of Masnavi until 1920s that Nicholson produced his translation (Javadi, 2005). An example of Whinfield translation:

“How long with you dwell on words and superficialities?

A burning heart is what I want; consort with burning!!

Kindle in thy heart the flame of love,

And burn up utterly thoughts and fine expression.

O Moses!! the lovers of fair rites are one class,

They whose hearts and souls with love are another” (Masnavi II: 1762 – 64)

Translation of Masnavi in English started with Redhouse translation of Book I in 1881(Dar ul Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008). Sir James William Redhouse who is known for his Turkish – English dictionary, translated Masnavi at the end of his life. Although he made a rhymed translation, it was not smooth and readable (Javadi, 2005). Later Nicholson, the greatest scholar in Rumi, criticized Redhouse’s translation as inaccurate. An example of Redhouse translation is compared with Nicholson’s accurate translation:

“What boot from counsel to a fool?

Dost thou know why the mirror (of thy soul) reflects nothing?

Because the rust is not cleaned from its face”(Masnavi I: 18, 34, 35).

( Darul. Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008)

The story of the king, fall in love with a handmaiden and buying her.

O my friend, hearken to this tale: in truth it is the very marrow of our inward state” (Masnavi I, 35).

Distortion occurred in Redhouse’s translation, he mistakenly translated line 35 as part of the song of reed while it is the beginning line of the story of the king falling in love with a handmaiden and buying her (Dar ul Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008)

Whinfield

In 1887 Edward Henry Whinfield, who had translated Omar Khayyam and Gulshan – I Raz of Mahmud Shabusti published a translation of Masnavi as “ Masnavi – I Manavi, the spiritual couplets of Mawlana Jalalu ‘d – Din Muhammad I Rumi “, a selection of all six book contained 3500 couplets both in prose and poetry. It was the best translation of Masnavi until 1920s that Nicholson produced his translation (Javadi, 2005). An example of Whinfield translation:

“How long with you dwell on words and superficialities?

A burning heart is what I want; consort with burning!!

Kindle in thy heart the flame of love,

And burn up utterly thoughts and fine expression.

O Moses!! the lovers of fair rites are one class,

They whose hearts and souls with love are another” (Masnavi II: 1762 – 64)

( Darul. Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008)

“و دق از ای این افاظ و اسماء و سخاوت میخواهند سایه به نیک که و این نور را سخاوت جان و دوستان دیگری؟

سوخته جان و روانان دیگر

( متنی م_NUMBER:1461

Wilson

In 1910, C.E. Wilson translated Book II of Masnavi in two volumes. Volume one was translation and volume two contained commentaries. Wilson gave commentary on his translations because he believed that obscure Persian poem needs a plain literal prose translation and much notes to become understandable to Europeans.

Wilson’s translation was acceptable for Nicholson. Nicholson wrote about Wilson’s work that comparing it with my own version of the second Book, I found that as similar methods produce similar results the two versions often agreed almost word for word, and that where they differed, the point at issue was usually one for discussion rather than correction.

An example of Wilson’s translation:

‘Enough of these words, conceptions, and figurative expressions! I wish for arsord, arsord! Arsord! Content yourself with this arsord.

Light up a fire of love in your soul, (and) burn entirely thought and expression.

Those whose soul and hearts are burnt are of another.
Every moment lovers are burnt (in the fire of love).
Taxes and titles are not exacted from a ruined village”. (Masnavi ii: 1762-65)
(Dar ul Masnavi of Mevlevi order, 2008)

Beside complete translations, some scholars translated only selections of the Masnavi. Arthur Jhon Arbury, the British scholar, in the University of London in 1944 made his translation from Nicholson’s translation. In fact he retranslated Nicholson’s translation. He published his work in two volumes “Tales from the Masnavi” in 1961 and “More Tales from the Masnavi” in 1963 (Darul I. Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008).

Translations of the Selections of the Masnavi
Arbery
Arbery (1993) mentioned that his motivation in translating was based on Nicholson's two works "Tales of Mystic Meaning" and "Rumi, poet and Mystic". The example and the success of these two books have encouraged him to translate anecdotes of the Masnavi in to English.

Although Arbery's translation as Nicholson's was Victorian sounding but it was easier to understand (Darul I. Masnavi of Mevlevi order, 2008).

Turkmen
Turkmen, another translator who translated excerpts from the Masnavi in Persian script, published his work as "The Essence of Rumi's Masnavi: including his life and works " in 1992. He followed each line of Masnavi with two paragraphs. One paragraph is translation and one is explanation. His translation is part translation and part paraphrase of the verses.

Example of his translation:
"Light up the fire of love in your soul, burn away thoughts and words totally. Lovers have to burn every moment for taxes and titles are not imposed on a ruined village. There exist no formalities of Kabae, within Kabae and what does it matter if a diver has no snow shoes? Don't seek guidance from intoxicated lovers, who do whose own garments return. Religion of love is different from all religions, lover's religion or belief is God" (Masnavi ii:1763,1765,1768,1770)
(Darul I. Masnavi of Mevlevi order,2008)

Gupta
Gupta, a Hindu scholar, translated the entire Masnavi into English. His translation was not a word for word translation like Nicholson. In his translation each line is paraphrased and a short commentary followed each line in brackets. Gupta translated from a Persian edition that contained several thousand extra lines that have been added to the Masnavi over centuries.

He published his translation as “Mawlana Rumi’s Masnavi” in six volumes in 1995. An example of his translation:
“With the departure of the rose, and the garden ruined, whence will the nightingale seek the fragrance of rose?
After all, it can come only from the rose, and not from rose-water, in the same order, [in the absence of the guru (rose) his disciples can only serve as poor substitute (rose-water). But something is always better than nothing. If the guru is not manifest, let us attend the company of his disciples.
At the appropriate hour he may become manifest”.(Darul I: 29)

(Tanzuki Mevlevi order, 2008)

"When the love of God rules your thoughts and intellect, it burns away everything but the presence of God. As a ruined village is exempt from taxes, similarly a ruined heart which loves God is not confined to the formal prayers. In the presence of God Himself what does a Qibla mean?
If you are not lover of God yourself then don't go after the lovers, because they are intoxicated with the love-wine and no prayers are imposed on the intoxicated ones and they cannot be your guide if you are not Orthodox" (Darul I. Masnavi of Mevlevi order,2008)

Versions
Beside all the translations produced by different scholars of Rumi's works, there are versions from the Masnavi. First we should define the version and its difference with translation then will go to the version makers.

As Darul I. Masnavi of the Mevlevi order (2008) mentioned the difference between version and translation is that translation is rendering the text directly from one language to another language but version is retranslating a translation. Version makers often do not familiarize with the original language of the text, what they produce is based on their understanding of the
translated text which often differ from the original and doesn't convey the real meaning of the original text.

Bark
The most popular versions of the Masnavi are Bark’s versions. He made his works based on the literal translation of Nicholson. The most famous and best selling of his versions is “The Essential Rumi” which includes selections of Masnavi versions from his earlier works published in 1995 (Daru I. Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008).

Parsinejad (2004) mentioned that Colman Barks, professor of English literature in Gorgea university in America motivated by his friend Robert Bly, the American poet, to retranslate Nicholson’s translation. Bly wanted him to make Rumi’s translation understandable for not only university students but also for the public.

It is mentioned in Daru I. Masnavi of the Mevlevi order (2008) that without any familiarization with Persian language Barks started translating Rumi’s poems. To become acceptable to modern American society he removed the spiritual concepts of Rumi’s poems and didn’t talk about Rumi, his life, his religion, and his society. Although Barks inserted his own ideas in his versions and in spite of all distortions, his translation made the Rumi’s poetry popular among modern American society. Although Barks insert his own ideas in his versions and in spite of all distortions, his translation made the Rumi’s poetry popular among modern American society.

An example of his translation based on a passage from Nicholson’s: “This being human is a guest house, Every morning a new arrival. A joy, a depression, a meanness, Some momentary awareness comes As an unexpected visitor” (Masnavi v: 3644,46). (Daru I. Masnavi of the Mevlevi order 2008)

Kabir Helminsky
Kabir Helmski was aware of old-fashioned style of Nicholson’s translation of the Masnavi and started retranslating it from Nicholson’s translation in companion with his wife Camille Helmski. He published his versions as “Rumi: Daylight”, selections from Book I and ii in 1994 and “Jewels of Remembrance” selections from Book iii–vi in 1996.

His translations were faithful to Rumi’s teachings and unlike others he didn’t try to insert his ideas in his renderings. An example of his work: “Every fantasy devours another fantasy: One thought feeds on another fantasy. You can’t be delivered form fantasy Or fall asleep to escape from it altogether. Your thoughts are like horns, and your sleep is Like the water in which you are plunged: when you awake, the horns return, And many hornet-like fantasies fly in And draw you now this way and then that way” (Masnavi v: 729-735).

Scholars on Rumi
Annemarie Schimmel
Annemarie Schimmel was born in 1992 in Germany. She was a professor in the faculty of Islamic Theology in Ankara University in 1954-1959. Her works are more than 80 books and essays. Her main focus have been Islamic literature, Islamic mysticism, and Sufism (Index of Rumi translators, 2004).

She wrote a book on the content of Rumi’s poetry as “A study of the works of Jalalod din Rumi” which was published in London in 1978. The book contains examples of metaphor and images that Rumi used in his poems. It also contains short passages from Masnavi and Rumi’s other works which show the elements used by Rumi in his works such as nature, daily life, philosophy, religion and mysticism (Daru I. Masnavi of Mevlevi order, 2008).

William C. Chittick
William C. Chittick, professor of the Department of comparative studies at the state university of New York, is another Rumi scholar. He dedicated his studies to the Islamic history especially philosophical and mystical theology of 12th and 13th century. He received his PH. D degree from Tehran university in 1974 (Index of Rumi translators, 2004).

Chittick’s book on Rumi contains short passages from the Masnavi and other Rumi’s works. In his work Chittick organized Rumi’s teaching according to their theme. Chittick published his book in 1983 as “The Sufi path of love: The spiritual teachings of Rumi” (Daru I. Masnavi of the Mevlevi order, 2008).

Victorian Era
Nineteenth century England, Victorian era was the time of great changes. England was progressing, people needed to know new sciences. It was during this era that translations of Rumi’s works have been started. People who have battled for the freedom of thought could have properly influenced by the concepts behind Rumi’s poems. Through such translations people could familiarized with anthropology, the science that was one of their basic needs that could cause progression in other aspects. As Walker (1910) mentioned

In the nineteenth century the battle for freedom of thought was won. Under such circumstances it is not only relevant and legitimate, but essential to pay some attention to the development of science, particularly in those branches which have been most directly influential in producing this revolution in thought. These are geology and biology, with the kindred science of anthropology. (p. 212)

Conclusion
Today Rumi is one of the greatest spiritual teachers of the world among the Westerns. Therefore they translate his works and write articles and books about his identity, thoughts and works, even some writers use Mawlana's poems in their works (Rasekh, 2009). In Italy Alexandra Buzani surveyed the different aspects of Mawlana's poems. Among writers who benefited from Mawlana's poems is Loie Masimi, the famous orientalist who used Mawlana's poems in his book on Mansoor Hallaj. Mawlana's poems inspired composers too. Nowadays composer, A. Zyanuski is the one who inspired by Mawlana’s poems in making his Night Song (Dakani, 2009). Besides translating Rumi’s works, some artists tried to introduce Mawlana to the West through film. In 1994 a film named Modara, taghdim be Mawlana Jalal ad din (Tolerance present to
Mawlana Jalal ad Din) was made in Atlanta with assistance of one of the English actresses. The purpose of the film was to encourage people to respect the others faith and goals (Rasekh, 2009). In recent years, Mawlana knowing clubs established in America and England. It is astonishing that some of these lover groups aren't Muslim. They are Americans who gather in a club to recite Mawlana's poems with Sama. Their work is such as gathering somewhere for praying. Not only poets, literary researchers and philosophers of the West World are affected by Mawlana's ideas and thoughts but also the greatest European psychologist Karl Jung studied Mawlana's thoughts and talked about it in one of his works. It shows that besides poetical and literary aspects of Mawlana's poems, his humanistic trainings conquered the hearts (Rasekh, 2009). The result of Mawlana's penetration is seeable around the entire West and among them the Americans have the bigger portion. As it is stated Rumi's calendars, Rumi's cd's, Rumi's posters, Rumi's T-shirt, even Rumi's coffee mugs have also found a market in the United States (Jalal, 2010).

References

Appendix A: List of Translations in chronological order:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translator</th>
<th>Translation</th>
<th>To</th>
<th>Date (A.D)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Joseph von Hammer Purgstall</td>
<td>Some parts of the Masnavi</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Redhouse</td>
<td>Book I of the Masnavi</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whinfield</td>
<td>Selection of all six of the Masnavi</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson</td>
<td>Book II of the Masnavi</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicholson</td>
<td>Book I &amp; Book II</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Book III &amp; Book IV</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Book V &amp; Book VI</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkman</td>
<td>Experts from the Masnavi</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arberry</td>
<td>Anecdotes of the Masnavi</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gupta</td>
<td>Six books of the Masnavi</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>